

**VILLAGE OF KALKASKA
PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
MAY 3, 2007**

COUNCIL CHAMBERS – 200 HYDE STREET

MINUTES OF THE MEETING

CALL TO ORDER

1. Shirley Whipple called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers. After the pledge to the flag and a prayer, the attendance was taken:

Planning Commissioners Present
Shirley Whipple, Chairperson
Virginia Thomas, Village President
Ruth Hall, Trustee
Bill Cousins, Village Manager
Francis Kelly
Al Jordan
Sue Walter
Bob Larsen

Planning Commissioners Absent
None

Public Present – Richard Skendzel, Randy Sherman, Jim Austin, Gene McLean, Joyce Hendricks, Wilma Hunting, Jeff Badgero, Sandy Husbands, Linda Barber, Linda Prough, Sue Vowels, Don Ball, Althea Ball, Dean Farrier, Paul Reed and Jeanine Deville.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Chairperson Whipple asked if anyone had any changes to the agenda.

Larsen made a motion to approve agenda as written. Kelly seconded the motion. On a voice vote, motion passed.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

2. Chairperson Whipple asked if there were any changes to the minutes from the April 5, 2007 meeting.

Thomas made a motion to approve the minutes from the April 5, 2007 meeting as written. Walter seconded the motion. On a voice vote, motion passed.

PUBLIC HEARING

3. Proposed Zone Change at 217 Maple Street – Chairperson Whipple stated that she was opening the public hearing for a proposed zone change at 217 Maple Street. Mr. Gene McLean, owner of 217 Maple Street, requested a zone change from R-2 Residential to C Commercial for the property at 217 Maple Street (parcel #40-041-741-007-50). Mr. McLean previously received a special use permit to use the lot as a parking lot for his hardware store. He would like to rezone that property to remove the special use restrictions. She asked Mr. McLean if he had anything to present to the public.

Mr. McLean stated that he was there to answer any questions the public may have regarding this zone change request.

Chairperson Whipple stated that Maple Street for about three blocks on the north side, under the Planning and Zoning Master Plan, was to be considered as commercial. There are some houses there yet, but that was a goal of the Planning Commission. She opened the floor to the Commission for any comments or questions. She stated that everyone would have three minutes to speak.

Walter stated that she did not see any problem with this due to the Master Plan.

Jordan felt it was an overdue change.

Thomas agreed with Jordan.

Hall stated she was in favor of the change.

Larsen stated he had no problem with the change.

Kelly stated that McLean's needed the change.

Chairperson Whipple stated it was time to do this since it has already been in the Master Plan since February of 2002. She closed the commission discussion and opened the floor to the public.

Joyce Hendricks asked what was involved with the zone change.

Chairperson Whipple stated that the parking lot was already there, so the zone change would make the lot legitimate with a Commercial zoning. She clarified that this would only change the zoning for that particular lot.

Jeff Badgero stated that he agreed with the proposal, and thought it was good to follow the Master Plan. He urged the citizens of Kalkaska to support the commercial businesses who help bring growth to the community. He stated that Gene McLean has been an excellent example of service to the community.

Sue Vowels felt that this zoning change should be supported.

Paul Reed was surprised that when the house was originally torn down, the zoning of the property to Commercial wasn't done at that time. He suggested that they look into finding a way to stop having cars back out into the street in front of the store.

Chairperson Whipple closed the Public Hearing. She stated that the Planning Commission heard comments tonight, and they needed to make a recommendation to the Village Council. The administration supported the rezoning request. She asked if they had any further comments.

Kelly made a motion to rezone the property at 217 Maple Street from R-2 Residential to C Commercial. Larsen seconded the motion. On a roll call vote with Chairperson Whipple and Larsen, Jordan, Thomas, Cousins, Hall, Walter and Kelly voting "Yea", motion passed.

SITE PLAN REVIEWS

4. A. New Kalkaska Memorial Health Center Dialysis Building at 514 Second Street – Chairperson Whipple stated that Randy Sherman with Three River's Corporation was present to make a presentation on behalf of the hospital. She stated that they have requested a site plan approval for a new 5,800 square foot single-story dialysis clinic to be operated by Kalkaska Memorial Health Center.

Randy Sherman stated that they had amended the site plan a number of times addressing comments from the administration. He briefly explained the mapped site plan to the Commission and the Public. He stated that the entry drive would be off of Second Street. There would also be a covered area for drop off in front of the building and barrier free parking along the side of the building. There would be sidewalk on two sides of the building and a staff entry/delivery area at the back of the building. He stated the building would be a combination of masonry and siding. The siding would be a similar color to the existing garage on the site. He asked if anyone had questions.

Jordan asked how much distance was between the garage and the proposed building.

Mr. Sherman stated that it was close to 24 feet.

Jordan asked if this had been approved by the Fire Department.

Cousins replied that he had not heard from the Fire Department yet.

Jordan was concerned about them being able to get fire vehicles in and around that area.

Mr. Sherman stated that there would be a wide driveway adjacent to the building and there would be access almost all the way around the entire perimeter of the building.

Mr. Badgero stated that building would be fully sprinkled and would also have a 24 hour monitored alarm system.

Cousins stated that there were nine items that needed to be resolved and had been included in a status letter (distributed to Commission members just before the meeting).

1. The first item was the zoning class of the southern part of Lot #3, had been shown as Commercial when it was zoned R-1. They had new maps with this corrected.
2. The screen fence extending from the south property line to the east property line was discussed, and Jim Austin the Hospital Administrator explained a color drawing.
3. Due to timing there was no signage submitted, which can be dealt with by the code enforcement officer at a later date.
4. The landscape plan was not submitted. Mr. Austin stated that there would be grass and some small bushes around the building.
5. The lights in the parking lot appeared to be lit at a level less than 1.0 lumens, which is typically the industry standard. This facility would not be used much after 6:00 pm initially. The concern was that the documents showed no lighting spilling over on the residential property to the south.
6. There was a concern about Second and Orange Streets water connection. The suggestion from 6 inches to 4 inches was taken under advisement and they confirmed they would comply with this.
7. There was a typo and there would be a 4-inch gate valve.
8. The storm drainage on site right now, from the middle of the parking lot towards the building, has levels that could make the water flow backwards. The engineer was concerned that this could become a maintenance problem, and it was mentioned so the hospital would be aware of it.
9. Cousins had not received anything from the Fire Department, and usually if Don Vyverberg doesn't respond, that meant everything was okay. He wondered if they would want to make approval contingent on final response from the Fire Department.

Cousins stated that from his review, dealing with the DPW and the Village engineer, he was satisfied that these items have been met and the project could be approved.

Chairperson Whipple stated that Cousins might want to convey to Mr. Vyverberg that a response from the Fire Department would be nice.

Cousins stated that he would work on that.

Mr. Austin asked Chairperson Whipple if Jeanine Deville, the director of the Dialysis Center at Munson Medical Center, could speak to the Commission.

Jeanine Deville thanked the Commission for the opportunity to speak. She has been a registered nurse for 34 years and about half of that time has been spent in dialysis. She has managed Munson's program for a little less than five years. Two years ago, as they began their summer season, they were able to accommodate one hundred patients. In addition to those patients, they accommodated a lot of snowbirds. She stated that they currently have 18 patients from Kalkaska who come to them three times a week for a four-hour a day treatment. She stated that these patients have other illnesses, as well as transportation

problems. She stated that they could no longer manage them in a way that was best for their well-being and quality of life. She asked if anyone had any questions from a clinical perspective.

Chairperson Whipple read a letter from Scott Yost, 407 S. Cherry Street (see original letter attached to minutes). She also read a letter from Marcel Cunningham, 510 S. Coral Street (see original letter attached to minutes). She asked if there was any public comment.

Sandy Husbands stated that she did not question the need for this program in the community; however, she questioned why the hospital couldn't relocate to a more central area outside of the Village. She stated that County property was only a few blocks away.

Sue Vowels stated that this project should be embraced, and that they were blessed to have such a facility.

Don Ball stated that this was good for the community, but he would like to see the hospital move outside the Village limits.

Althea Ball was glad to see this program happening, but also wanted to see the hospital move out of the Village. She felt the taxes were going down on their property due to the hospital. She asked if the hospital had purchased Level Acres, and wondered when this was going to stop.

Mr. Austin stated that they were not buying Level Acres, but they were to become the board of directors for that facility.

Paul Reed asked what it would cost to relocate the hospital, and that he couldn't look at it as being an alternative. He stated that the community was growing and the need for services was growing. He felt uncomfortable with the hospital being the board of directors for Level Acres.

Chairperson Whipple stated there was a hospital board, which held regular meetings, and they would be the people to answer these questions. Chairperson Whipple stated that she thought Level Acres had asked the hospital to step in as board of directors.

Walter felt that this program was very needed in this community.

Jordan supported the hospital and he was in favor of the project.

Thomas was in favor of the program and felt that it was needed. She believed that if that program had been here a couple of years ago, her sister would be alive today.

Hall was in favor of the program.

Larsen felt the program was a good idea, and he felt some people got off the subject because this was for the dialysis unit not a two-story project for the hospital.

Kelly was in favor of the program.

Chairperson Whipple stated that she had to go to Traverse City in the past, three days a week for radiation, and noted some people who spent many long days traveling back and forth to Munson. She felt that this would help a lot of people.

Larsen made a motion to recommend approval of the site plan for the dialysis unit at 514 Second Street contingent on Fire Department approval and send it on to the Village Council. Jordan seconded the motion. On a roll call vote with Chairperson Whipple and Hall, Walter, Cousins, Larsen, Kelly, Thomas and Jordan voting "Yea", motion passed.

B. Partial Demolition and Building Addition at 419 S. Coral Street – Chairperson Whipple stated that Jeff Badgero, on behalf of the Kalkaska Memorial Health Center, had submitted a site plan application for a partial demolition of an older part of the hospital (3,250 sq. ft.) and a new two-story addition to be put in its place. The new addition was about 21,000 sq. ft. per floor. They were also asking for approval to place a 26 x 48 portable building in an alcove on the south side of the building during the project. Chairperson Whipple asked Jeff Badgero if he was speaking and Jeff deferred to Mr. Austin.

Mr. Austin deferred to their architect; however, he felt that he should take a moment to clarify a couple of issues. He stated that their intention for Level Acres was to oversee Medallion, who was under a three-year contract. In the meantime, they were going to mainly evaluate their management. He assured that anyone was welcome to come meet with him to clarify any issues. Mr. Austin continued by admitting that they do not expect to be approved for their entire project, however, they hoped to gain approval for the temporary building and for the building demolition to begin to move the project along.

Richard Skendzel with Architecture Technology in Traverse City stated he was the architect involved with the hospital. He stated there were a number of questions asked and he felt they had addressed most of those issues with the re-submission. He believed that the height issue was number one and he was going to spend some time talking about that. He explained the diagrams to the Commission. He stated that the actual size of the new addition would be about 10,000 sq. ft. of new space per floor, not 21,000 sq. ft. They were doing some renovation work to the existing parking lot at the north corner of the site, and reworking the area between the Stonehouse and the hospital to provide a new drop off and covered access. He submitted an outline to the Commission in regards to the height of the new building. He stated that the hospital wanted to describe the rationale behind having a couple of elements on the roof that extended above the 35-foot maximum height. The height of the main portion of the roof was 32 feet. There were two elements that would project above the height limit. One was a light monitor that pops up above the roof with glass on the sides. The purpose would be to bring in natural light to the interior of the building. There was also an esthetic interest here so that they didn't end up with just a flat roofline. The second element, which was a little bit taller, was screening for the mechanical system on the roof. They would have two large air handler units and three condensers located on the roof. Furthermore, if they wanted to cover those with decorative screen walls, this would come up about 44 feet above grade. He did some research on fire codes and building codes to make sure that he had a good understanding about the safety code requirements. Michigan Building Code allowed them to build up to 85 feet. The NFPA Flight Safety Code, which has jurisdiction for a hospital building, allowed three-stories. He asked if the Commission had any questions.

Cousins stated that the summary of ordinances could be shown as nothing allowed, and typically in an ordinance if it was not spoken, it was not allowed. The third sheet talking about building codes and maximum limits was fine, but if you build a building and the fire department can only get water to the first two floors and the 10th floor was burning, it wouldn't be good. Cousins stated that they needed to consider what the neighboring residents would have to look at every day and, while it would be nice to screen the equipment on the top of the roof, it would make the building 44 feet tall. Cousins stated that he wanted to encourage and support the hospital. He stated the hospital had to build where they were, so that's why they had plans to build up and not out. He stated that they were in a residential area, and needed to be sensitive to their neighbors. He stated that, in his opinion, they needed to continue to work on the 20 items with the height issue being one of the main issues.

Chairperson Whipple asked if the public had any questions or comments.

Gene McLean was sympathetic to the people who live in that area. He built a house in an area when there was only one school on Birch Street. He then sat there and watched the school system expand until it encompassed the whole area. He was a firm believer that as a community that they have two things to offer, one being a good education and the other one being a good health care system. He would like to see people embrace the growth of the hospital. He felt that the hospital was trying to be good neighbors to the people around them.

Sue Vowels wanted to concur with what Gene McLean had said, and also understood that growth was hard. She stated that hospital growth was necessary if they expected Kalkaska to have any growth in population. She stated that she has been a part of five of the transactions where the hospital bought property around them, and only once the property had not been listed or advertised for a considerable time. She stated the hospital had not gone behind the scenes to gobble up the community.

Don Ball agreed that they needed to have a good hospital; however, other communities were building new hospitals outside of their towns, where the hospital has room to expand without impeding on residential areas.

Althea Ball stated that it was easy for everyone to support the hospital when they don't live there. She stated the area was no longer quiet and, because of the hospital, she would not be able to sell her home right now if she tried.

Paul Reed agreed with what Mr. McLean had to say. He agreed that it would be much nicer to attain medical services here rather than having to drive to Traverse City or somewhere else. He could not see the point in relocating the hospital.

Chairperson Whipple read a letter from Scott Yost, 407 S. Cherry Street (see original letter attached to minutes). She also read a letter from Marcel Cunningham, 510 S. Coral Street (see original letter attached to minutes). She asked if the Commissioners had any comments or questions.

Hall stated that they should wait until the 20 items were resolved.

Larsen thought it was a good idea; however, they needed to give a lot of consideration to the neighbors. He did not feel they should make any action on it until the 20 items were addressed.

Kelly stated that they knew the rules, and the building should be built within the 35 feet. He does support the hospital and the services they give, but rules are rules.

Thomas stated they needed to work on the 20 items; however, they do need the hospital. She asked if they could consider giving them permission to put the portable building on their property and begin the demolition, even though they couldn't act on the site plan tonight.

Jordan agreed with what Virginia said, and wondered the necessity of the additional height.

Walter stated that they worked hard on the medical district to stop outer expansion of the hospital, and allow them to work within their space. She felt that as long as they followed the guidelines, and dealt with the 20 items, this hospital expansion was necessary for the community.

Chairperson Whipple felt the 20 items did need to be worked on, but would like to see the Commission approve the demolition and the temporary building on the hospital site. She loves Village living and grew up on Cherry Street. She knows for a fact that her parents' home had forlorn looking houses behind it, and they came down when the parking lot was created. She stated that they never had trouble with light shining in, and at no time has the value of the property decreased. She stated that people would have to adapt to the growth of the hospital. She has friends who moved to the country, and found that things weren't so convenient. Her reason for being on the commission was to make sure that businesses did not encroach upon residential neighborhoods; however, she did not see the hospital as a commercial business.

Thomas made a motion to give the hospital permission to put the portable building for the temporary administrative offices on hospital property, and to be able to start demolition on the other part of the hospital while the other plans are tabled and all items are resolved. Kelly seconded the motion. On a roll call vote with Chairperson Whipple, and Thomas, Cousins, Walter, Hall, Kelly, Jordan and Larsen voting "Yea", motion passed.

CURRENT BUSINESS

5. Master Plan Update – Chairperson Whipple stated that they had intended to see how the meeting went, and possibly discuss Chapters Six and Seven. She looked at the packet and felt it would make for a very long night if they did go over those chapters. She personally would feel comfortable postponing that as they have five years in between revisions to the Master Plan.

Thomas made a motion to table review of Chapters Six and Seven of the Master Plan until the next meeting. Hall seconded the motion. Motion passed on a voice vote.

PUBLIC COMMENT

6. Chairperson Whipple asked if there was any public comment on items not on the agenda.

Mr. Austin stated that it would probably cost upwards of 39 million dollars to move the hospital, and then the community would be left with a vacant building in the middle of a residential neighborhood. If he had foreseen this problem back in 1988, they could have built a hospital outside of the Village. Munson Medical Center has the same problem as they are built in a residential neighborhood; however, the home prices around the hospital were surprisingly high as hospital employees wished to live there.

Sue Vowels stated that in her experience the closer neighborhoods to the hospital have a higher value, depending of course on the house itself.

Chairperson Whipple stated that when she was a child the hospital was built in a field, as there were no houses in that area at the time.

Gene McLean asked about the three-story townhouses on Dresden, and if that issue was ever addressed.

Cousins stated that they were built before the site plan reviews were put into place; however, the fire department had said they couldn't service that building.

ADJOURNMENT

7. Motion by Larsen, second by Kelly to adjourn. Motion passed on a voice vote. Meeting adjourned at 8:42 p.m.

Typed by: Mary Deb Rabourn, Deputy Clerk